



Implemented by:



CONFERENCE



REFUGEES

INTEGRATION
HARMONISATION
SOLIDARITY
HOSPITALITY
OR WHAT?

**Philosophies, Policies,
and Practices in Turkey
and Germany**

Conveners

Franck DUVELL, *Osnabruck University, IMIS*
Ali Zafer SAGIROGLU, *AYBU, GPM*

Advisory Board

Ahmet ICDUYGU, *MiReKoc, Koc University*
Basak KALE, *Middle East Technical University*
Saime OZCURUMUZ, *Bilkent University*
Annette KORNTHEUER, *KU Eichstädt Ingolstadt*
Zeynep YANASMAYAN, *DeZIM*

Date 26 November 2021
Venue Point Hotel Barbaros, Istanbul

Hybrid Event Registration for Online Participation
gpm.aybu@gmail.com



Turkey Migration Studies Network

TurkMiS

Panel 1

Local Level and the Role of Municipalities

Round of Panels I

Başak KALE *Middle East Technical University, Ankara* _____

1. The Role of Local Governments and Local Integration of Refugees in Turkey

Since 2011 many local authorities and municipalities in different cities in Turkey had to respond to the immediate needs of refugees. Over time, emergency response actions had to turn into integration related services. Local authorities and municipalities that host high number of refugees in metropolitan areas took the initiative to provide services that will support social cohesion and integration. As the numbers of the refugees increased and their stay prolonged over time, the needs of Syrian refugees have also changed accordingly. Looking at four main metropolitan municipalities around Turkey, mainly Istanbul, Izmir, Ankara and Gaziantep, this research argues that these emergency relief responses turned into local integration efforts. The lack of official social integration policies was compensated by local governments sometimes intentionally and most of the time unintentionally through tailored responses. The services provided by the municipalities adapted to these changes. The changes in policies were a reflection on the goal to create a stronger social cohesion among district inhabitants. Although it is difficult to argue that local governments aim to directly address issues on social cohesion, the general understanding of their actions were targeting "solidarity" among fellow citizens to avoid tensions. Metropolitan municipalities have operated towards these goals through adapting their institutional structures, developing policies and actions as well as increasing their collaboration and cooperation with SCOs and IOs through grants and projects. This understanding is in line with the diverse definitions in the conceptualization of social cohesion in literature where social cohesion as a concept evolved to include aspects of social exclusion, social capital and social mobility.

2. Localisation of Integration Policies in Turkey: Reflections from Kilis

Integration is a protean, or indeed a chaotic concept, whose meaning change over time and from country to country, as well as reflecting various interests and perspective of the parties involved. Due to the emergency of the issue on a global scale, there has been an increase in bureaucratic and scholarly attempts to make sense of how different states deal with integration and how integration policies and politics are characterised. In the last three decades, Western European states have mostly converged in their integration programs and policies by shunning policies toward difference (multiculturalism) and enjoyed in various degrees a concern with civic integration, i.e., assimilation. Turkey has recently undergone a legislative reform resulting in the adoption of the first and most comprehensive asylum law of the country, and the establishment of the Directorate General of Migration Management (DGMM). The DGMM with offices in all Turkish provinces is also responsible for planning and implementing integration related policies and projects. Granting that dealing with refugees in Turkey at the present time is not a matter of sending them back to Syria, the DGMM focuses on, inter alia, providing them with better settlement and integration opportunities. However, as the country's integration policy is still very centralised it does not suffice to address the various problems faced in different Turkish cities. For instance, Kilis, a Turkish city near the Syrian border and hosting Syrian refugees at times as many as its own population and surprisingly with less problems compared to other Turkish cities is a good case in point. Therefore, this study is an attempt to reflect on integration-related experiences of Kilis, as well as suggesting new and localised models to address the issue. Acknowledging the fact that integration of Syrian refugees is a multifaceted process and the recent DGMM attempts to address the issue of integration have recently been implemented or just being planned to be implemented, the study concludes that both bureaucratic and scholarly attempts to understand and assess Turkish migration policies as to integration of Syrian refugees need to be developed with a local twist. Finally, the study concludes that reflections on the experiences of Kilis can provide further insights into addressing the intricacies of integration policies and their implementation in local settings.

Panel 1

Local Level and the Role of Municipalities

Sonja REINHOLD *FAU Erlangen -Nürnberg, Nürnberg*

3. Match'In. Pilot Project for the Dispersal of Asylum-Seekers with an Algorithm-Supported Matching Procedure

"Match'In – pilot project for the placement of asylum seekers and refugees with the help of an algorithm-based matching system" (05/2021 – 04/2024)

The distribution and allocation of refugees and asylum seekers constitutes an intensively discussed field, not only in the international and EU context but also in Germany. The impacts of distribution and allocation processes are particularly visible on the local level where the central cornerstones for any further integration processes are being laid (Bommes 2018; Caponio und Borkert 2010; Schiller 2019; Scholten 2019; Zapata-Barrero et al. 2017). Evidently, not only asylum seekers and refugees but also local communities and municipalities are highly heterogeneous – thus, not every person feels comfortable and wants to or can build a future at the same place and not every local community can offer the same adequate supplies to respond to their needs and wishes relevant for further integration processes. Simultaneously, voices have become louder which are demanding a more active role for local authorities within the migration management (Bendel et al. 2019; Bendel et al. 2020; Schwan 2017).

4. Bureaucratic Challenges Refugees Face With: Narratives from a Turkish City

This study, which is considered as another outcome of the study conducted in July 2021 with immigrants, local people and local institutions in Elazig and focusing on the role of local institutions in the integration of immigrants, focuses on the encounters of Syrian, Iraqi and Afghan immigrants with bureaucracy in their experiences in urban life. This experience is discussed particularly in the context of bureaucracy and the difficulties experienced in the process of meeting institutional needs. Thus, the refugee identity, which is produced by including some of the more local realities of migration, such as social encounters, living together, and the reflection of diversity in everyday life in urban public spaces, gains a different form and content in encounters with local or urban bureaucracy.

Face-to-face interviews with open-ended questions were treated with 22 people, including the Mukhtar of Sanayi Neighborhood, the representative of the association (IHH), and the employers from the people of Elazig. Among these interviewees, there are 13 immigrants. Although the interviews focused on the individual, in most interviews, richer data was obtained with the experiences and narratives of family members.

This study focuses on the narratives of four immigrants who had different experiences with bureaucracy and experienced various bureaucratic difficulties differently from other immigrants. In this paper, I will try to deal with the effect of the struggle of two Syrian, an Afghan, and an Iraqi immigrant with the immigration bureaucracy in different periods on the construction of urban lives of refugees. I consider the immigration bureaucracy more in the context of the provincial immigration administration's attitude towards immigrants, while I approach the local bureaucracy as the cooperation established between/among the municipal authorities, Mukhtar's office, and associations.

Unlike those in Europe, immigrants in Turkey are less confronted with the bureaucratization of their daily lives. Immigrants are supposed to participate in admissions programs, language courses, working life orientations etc. in European states. State bureaucracy, in other words, has to resort to welfare bureaucracy frequently in admission to the country and in the routine of daily life. However, immigrant integration programs such as compulsory language courses, orientation to business life, compulsory admission program are not obligatory in Turkey, and immigrants have to contact the bureaucracy for their own extra demands, except for areas such as registration, benefiting from the health system or basic education etc. Street level bureaucrats are the bureaucratic level that immigrants mostly deal with for the institutional arrangement of daily life in Turkey. However, even encounters with street-level bureaucrats in the immigration bureaucracy within the said urban bureaucracy mean a struggle for refugees.

Panel 2

Urban Perspectives

Mahmut KAYA *Harran University, Sanliurfa* _____

1. The Role of Religious Institutions and Networks for the Integration of Syrians in Turkey

Integration in the international migration process is a key issue for the peaceful coexistence of refugees and the host community. Integration generally involves the legal/political dimension, the socioeconomic dimension, and the cultural and religious rights dimensions of refugees. Integration is a dynamic multidimensional relationship involving many actors such as the immigrants themselves, the host government, institutions and communities. This study examined the effects of religious institutions and networks on the integration process, specifically for Muslim Syrians under temporary protection in Turkey. In the study, it was aimed to examine the functions of the religious institutions and networks, that existed before the war and were built during the war and migration, of the Syrian refugees, who took refuge in Şanlıurfa since 2011 due to the civil war in Syria, in the migration and integration process. The study was based on the dimensions of employment, housing, education, health, social bridges, social bonds, social links, language and cultural knowledge, safety and stability, rights and citizenship, that were specified by Ager and Strang (2008) in the field of integration, to determine the functions of religious institutions and networks in the migration and integration process. The qualitative method was adopted in the study. The data collected by in-depth individual interview and document review techniques. In this context, interviews were held with 36 Syrians (28 men, 8 women) and 7 local people from religious institutions and networks, and the activities reflected in the press were examined. Syrians in Eyyübiye, Haliliye and Karaköprü, which are the central districts of Şanlıurfa where Syrians are densely settled, and in Akçakale and Suruç districts, which borders the city with Syria, were included in the study.

According to the results of the study, it was observed that the religious institutions and networks were active in the integration processes at different degrees in ten themes identified by Ager and Strang depending on their resources and capacities. The institutionalization and network development of Syrian Muslim religious communities in Turkey in the international migration process is a key finding. Religious institutions and networks are an important shelter for refugees in terms of trust and belonging. While the capital that has developed with the inclusion of these structures provides advantages for refugees in accessing various resources, it provides psychological relief and meaning against the trauma of immigration and war. Religious institutions and networks serve as social bonds for the refugee community and as a social bridge and link in the relations with the host society and institutions. In the study, it was determined that religious institutions and networks acted as intermediaries and guides in humanitarian aid and access to public services. Religious education is at the center of institutions and networks. Although religious and language education is carried out within the context of adaptation projects, in which various institutions are stakeholders, the activities of informal institutions and networks continue within the framework of tolerance of local authorities. Religious institutions and networks, by their nature, have a structure that excludes people of different beliefs and views. In this context, integration progresses in a way that excludes some of the refugees since it takes place through limited and specific religious identities, which may lead to the construction of parallel lives, social closure and marginalization. It is important to examine the Muslim groups from the host society and the Syrian non-Muslim groups on a scientific basis in order to holistically reveal the effects of faith-based organizations in the migration and integration process.

2. Understanding Experiences of Urban Protracted Displacement in Germany and Turkey Through a Transnational Chronotope Lens

Understanding experiences of urban protracted displacement in Germany and Turkey through a transnational chronotope lens.

For the past decade, several millions of refugees from Syria, as well as Afghanistan, Iraq and Iran have arrived and settled in Turkey in situations of urban protracted displacement, in which they are neither able to permanently integrate, nor return, nor resettle to another country. Since 2014, many have continued to Europe and especially Germany and have started to settle there. In German metropolises such as Berlin and Frankfurt, they encounter an already diverse population with a long history of forced and voluntary migration from Turkey. Many Syrian, Afghani and other refugees living in Germany in turn maintain connections to family members and friends who have remained in Turkey. Despite the strong historical and contemporary connections between Germany and Turkey, experiences of refugees of urban protracted displacement have so far been analysed in entirely separate and nationally oriented terms. Drawing on initial ideas from my ongoing PhD fieldwork on the politics of time in urban protracted displacement in Germany and Turkey, this paper proposes to understand experiences of refugees in both contexts through the lens of an overlapping transnational chronotope. Drawing on notions of the chronotope first coined by Bakhtin, I suggest that the German-Turkish connections of refugees as well as the local population across space, together with strong if uneasy political ties between both countries, contribute to sharing similar times and spatio-temporal experiences, e.g. of precarity, temporariness, and a heightened comparative awareness of the local situation. This may have implications for community relations and imaginations of social cohesion in the present and future of refugees and citizens alike.

Panel 2

Urban Perspectives

Lidwina GUNDACKER

Institute for Employment Research (IAB), Migration and International Labour Studies, Nuremberg

3. Determined to Succeed: How to Local Infrastructure Shapes the Integration Trajectories of Refugees in Germany

Since 2015, more than 3 million people have sought humanitarian refuge in Germany. The successful integration into the German society and labor market requires refugees to take investments such as visiting German classes, picking up job training or establishing a new social network. While refugees are distributed all across Germany, not all municipalities are equally equipped with a respective infrastructure. At the same time, research has shown that delays at an early stage after arrival can cause less favorable integration outcomes in the medium to long run.

Exploiting the unique natural experiment of the German dispersal policy of refugees, this paper investigates for German regions whether the refugees' resource endowment due to the local infrastructure at arrival shapes their integration trajectories in the long term. For the empirical investigation, we rely on the IAB-BAMF-SOEP Sample of Refugees in Germany linked to the administrative employment data of the German Federal Employment. To examine the role of the local infrastructure, we augment the individual-level data with data on the municipality and the federal state of the applicant's initial residence. Assuming that the integration into a new society is a life course process rather than a set of unlinked events, we apply sequence analysis. This biographical approach allows us to identify various typical integration trajectories of refugees in Germany and relate them to the immediate surrounding of refugees, such as the supply of education, health care and childcare services, the local labor market conditions, the citizens' overall attitude towards newcomers, or the public transport system.

4. Volunteers and Refugee Integration in Germany: Lessons from the Summer of Welcome

The pictures of volunteers greeting asylum seekers with sweets and toys for children at train stations in Germany in 2015 went around the world. However, volunteers provided crucial services far beyond that, offering language classes, helping with administrative tasks and much more. A boom in volunteering for refugees began in 2014 and lasts until today but it changed over time. This paper gives an insight into who those volunteers are, what they do and what role they play in the integration of refugees. It discusses what made the volunteering movement so successful and what are its challenges, specifically what relationship should civil society have to the state when it comes to integrating refugees? Can lessons be drawn for other countries such as Turkey?

Panel 3

Role of Civil Society

Hilal BARIN *Ankara Yıldırım Beyazıt University, Ankara* —

1. The Role of NGOs in Syrians' Integration to Turkey: Case of Ankara

Turkey experienced the largest mass migration in its history as a result of the civil war that started in Syria in March 2011, following the "Arab Spring". In this process, the Turkish government and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) have been complementary actors in migration management with their strategies and activities for immigrant integration. In order to reduce the social cost of the problem, all relevant NGOs do not hesitate to take this burden, they have an important share and contribute to the reduction of refugee problems. This research aims to analyze the role of NGOs in the integration of refugees. Thus, it aims to contribute to politics and social sciences by discussing the role of NGOs in immigrant integration within the framework of broader models, legal policies and measures. On the role of NGOs in the integration of Syrians in Turkey the face-to-face semi-structured interview research methodology was selected for this study from the qualitative research method and the descriptive analysis method was used. In this regard, semi-structured interviews were conducted with the managers, employees and experts of 18 NGOs in Ankara.

Annette JUNEMANN *Institute for International Politics*

Sandra GOTTSCHÉ *Helmut Schmidt University, Hamburg*

Yaiza ROJAS-MATAS *University of the Federal Armed Forces in Hamburg, Hamburg* _____

2. Vulnerability and Agency in the Asymmetric Relationship Between Refugees and Their Volunteer Supporters: A Critical Assessment of Germany's "Welcome Culture"

Six years after the arrival of about 900.000 asylum seekers in Germany, it is time for a critical review of Germany's famous 'welcome culture'. Much of the initial euphoria in summer and fall 2015 vanished over the years, but the remaining associations, clubs and semi-organised volunteers managed to establish sustainable structures of support for refugees. These have a positive impact on refugees' capacities to cope with vulnerabilities and to express agency. At times, however, volunteers can also provoke - often unintended - effects of disempowerment. This article focuses on refugees' agency within the social context of their interactions with volunteer-supporters. Conceptually, we hold that vulnerability and agency are relational categories that represent two sides of the same coin.

Panel 3

Role of Civil Society

Zeynep SAHIN MENCUTEK

Bonn International Center for Conversion (BICC), Bonn

3. Refugee Community Organizations: Capabilities, Interactions, Limitations

This paper focuses on ways in which refugee-led community organisations (RCOs) carve out a space of influence through civic activism in the migration architectures of receiving countries. Building on scholarship addressing migration governance and grassroots refugee organisations, it argues that RCOs have become vital in the refugees' search for means to alleviate the sufferings of their fellows, to empower their community and claim rights for an improvement of their conditions. The notions of invented and invited spaces are convenient to describe opportunities, limitations and the ways of interactions encountered by emerging formal and informal RCOs. Drawing on qualitative data obtained from Syrian (and Afghan) RCOs and governance actors in Turkey, the article demonstrates how increasing numbers of RCOs operate in the invited spaces opened by the state agencies and international donors. Only rarely, however, are RCOs able to invent spaces to change existing power relations. The findings can serve to analyse the dynamics of new refugee groups' collective actions as well as their interactions with governance actors at transnational, national and local levels.

4. The Role of the State in Supporting Civil Society`s refugee work: Germany`s 'Live Democracy!' programme

Since the first recruitment agreement for guest workers in the 1950s, it has taken decades for the Federal Republic of Germany to politically recognize at the beginning of 2000 that Germany is a country of immigration. Today, this fact is hardly disputed in politics, science and the general public.

Since the 1970s there is a strong liberalization of society, driven by movements that advocate diversity and its recognition and equality. The "long summer of migration" (Kasperek, Speer, 2015), which was discussed in the public discourse as a 'culture of welcome', showed a very strong involvement of civil society in practices of solidarity with refugees in Germany. Yet, also many developments in recent years challenge the liberal democracy: an increase in Far-Right extremism and right-wing populism - which also mobilise against refugees - movements with anti-pluralistic, conspiracy theoretic, xenophobic, racist or anti-Semitic attitudes. It is obvious that parts of the population actively reject the diversification of society (Decker, Kiess, Brähler 2014; Foroutan 2018; Zick, Küpper, Krause 2016).

Within this, tensions of pro-plurality movements on the one hand and anti-plurality movements on the other, Germany's "Live Democracy!" programme facilitates civil society projects all over Germany which develop and trial new ideas and innovative approaches in promoting democracy, shaping diversity and preventing extremism. With this programme, the Federal Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth has been supporting civic engagement for a diverse and democratic society since 2015.

This paper sheds light on the role of the State in supporting civil society's refugee work. It asks what pitfalls and stumbling blocks there are and what can be learned from the German programme "Demokratie leben!" to help civil society in supporting refugees. In order to answer this question, this paper will present the results of the scientific monitoring of the programme „Demokratie leben!“.

Panel 4

Family, Children, Education

Talip KUCUKCAN *Marmara University, Istanbul* _____

1. Germany Integrating Syrians in Turkey Higher Education

Turkey has pursued an open door policy to displaced Syrians since 2011 and developed a multi-layered policy of inclusion over the years. However, many challenges remain to be addressed with regard to integration of Syrians into social, cultural, economic and educational sectors amidst growing populism in recent years. Will Syrians remain in Turkey or leave? How many will return if reasonable political and economic ground is prepared? If there will be a voluntary wave of return, how, when and how long this will take place? What are the social, political and economic ramifications of the presence of 3.7 million Syrian refugees in Turkey? How has Turkey been coping with various dimensions of hosting the largest number of refugees in Turkey? These are the frequently asked questions in and outside of Turkey. This paper provides evidence from the higher education sector into which Syrian migrants are increasingly integrated and makes recommendations to expand their presence in tertiary education as a one of the pillars of inclusion by the larger society.

Ellen KOLLENDER *Helmut Schmidt University, Hamburg*

2. Involving Civil Society Actors in Shaping Schools that are Sensitive to Discrimination - Approaches, Strategies, and Challenges in Germany and Turkey

In the context of increasing forced migration to Germany and Turkey in the wake of the Syrian war, numerous civil society initiatives for, by and with 'refugees' have emerged that involve educational projects. These are often collaborations with educational institutions such as schools. Former studies focused on these initiatives have primarily considered the question of how they contribute to the 'integration' of refugee children into the German and Turkish education system, while still following an understanding of civil society educational support that is mainly targeting the side of the 'refugee student'.

So far, little attention has been given to if and how the initiatives also address and challenge institutional factors such as a monolingual school culture, as well as racist perceptions and discriminatory pedagogical practices, that may hamper 'refugee students' learning, affect their sense of belonging as well as their chances of settling successfully. In my presentation, I consider the role of civil society initiatives in shaping schools which are sensitive to discrimination. For this, I take a closer look at the actors' activities in the field of forced migration and education, and how they assess and address different forms of discrimination that 'refugee students' experience in German and Turkish schools.

My presentation is based on empirical case studies in Istanbul and Berlin, where I conducted semi-structured interviews with representatives from civil society actors involved in education projects and collaborations with state schools. Firstly, I discuss the current forms and dimensions of discrimination experienced by 'refugee students' in the German and Turkish school systems and present the (different) legal-political framework conditions with regard to the cooperation between civil society and educational institutions in Germany and Turkey. I then suggest an approach for anti-discriminatory school development against the background of which I analyze different fields of tension in which collaborations between civil society actors and schools currently take place, and administrative processes as well as discourses about dealing with migration-related diversity and difference are being negotiated. Thereby, potentials and obstacles for developing a sustainable response to discrimination in and through school cooperation become apparent.

I show that beyond the practical support for 'refugee students' it is possible for civil society initiatives in both countries to stimulate a reflection on discrimination in state schools. However, the possibilities for cooperatively dealing with discrimination, especially at the institutional level, are limited due to the (lack of) political regulations, powerful social discourses on integration and belonging, as well as exclusionary school routines. On this basis, I discuss how an exchange between civil society and schools can be stimulated in order to leave no child behind in the German and Turkish education system.

Panel 4

Family, Children, Education

Mehmet FANSA

Hatay Provincial Directorate of National Education, Hatay

3. The Life of Syrian Children in a Temporary Shelter Center in Turkey: An Ethnographic Study on Primary School Education

This research aims to describe the life and education experiences in temporary shelter center of primary school children who took refuge in Turkey by escaping from the civil war in Syria with ethnographic perspective. The study was conducted with ethnographic research design. The participants of the research consist of fourth -grade students who accommodate in the temporary shelter center and receive education in the temporary education center in 2018-2019 academic year in Altınözü district of Hatay province, their teachers, parents and close social circle. Data describing children's life and education experiences in the temporary shelter center were collected between February 2019 and November 2019. Observation, interview, field note, researcher's diary and ethnographic photography were used to collect research data. Content analysis technique was used in the analysis of research data.

As a result of the analysis of the data, the nature of daily life in the temporary shelter center, the life and educational experiences of children were depicted with an ethnographic perspective. The research findings consist of two parts. The first part describes the pre-asylum lives of students and their families living in the temporary shelter center, their escape from the war and their meeting with the temporary shelter center in order to capture the point of view of the local. On the other hand, the settlement structure of the temporary shelter center, the socio-economic life of the container city, the daily life routines of the children, the place of the games in the daily lives of the children, the description of the translator student and the belief discourses of the children are included. In the second part; The re-schooling period of the students after the migration, Turkish and Arabic lesson experiences of students in the temporary education center, the relation with Turkish of the games played by the children, the effect of the life in the temporary shelter center on Turkish learning, the professional experiences of the teachers in the shelter center, the parents' perspectives on education in the temporary shelter center and the educational reflections of the social life are explained.

The research recommends to carry out more ethnographic researches with children under temporary protection to describe their life stories and indigenous perspectives, to adopt multi-cultural education policies and to organize in-service trainings on teaching Turkish to foreigners.

4. Syrian Refugees Between Gendered Kin-Contract and Citizenship in Germany and Turkey

As two of the major countries that received Syrians during the exodus led by the civil war, Turkey and Germany have responded to this wave of migration with different asylum and migration management schemes. These responses have created a significant disparity between the family constellations of Syrian refugees in these countries and produced different outcomes at the intersections of familial care arrangements and citizenship statuses. In the 'liminal legality' of migrant lives, legal statuses (including temporary protection, refugeedom, and full citizenship) and family are deeply entangled, and affect how each other is experienced, lived, and envisaged. Family constellations and family relations, also have deep and direct effects on feelings of belonging, identification with the host society, and in the end, social cohesion.

In this presentation, I foreground kinship as a system of relatedness founded on gendered care practices. I also refer to the 'kin-contract' as formulated by Suad Joseph—the patriarchal scaffolding of familial entitlements and obligations—to trace how it unfolds under the differential conditions in Germany and Turkey. Based on ethnographic research in Istanbul and narrative research in Berlin and Leipzig, I compare the effects of the migration and citizenship regimes of both countries on the experience and consequences of this 'kin-contract' in Syrian refugees' lives. I argue that Turkey's migration regime has allowed for fuller family constellations, at the same time (and also because) it has been hesitant to give Syrians long-term legal status. Little promises of a secure future have come along with softer governmental restraints on families and therefore there has been little friction between their kin-contract and the country's citizenship regime. However, family rights defined by migration law in Germany fall short of recognising certain configurations of families as lived relatedness, and this breaches the 'kin-contract' that has been prevalent in the lives of Syrians. Both of these outcomes require different, yet interrelated, policy responses, which will be briefly addressed in the presentation.

Panel 5

Alternative Approaches and Concepts

Round of Panels II

Saime OZCÜRUMEZ *Bilkent University, Ankara*

1. Why does social cohesion remedy uncertainty and precarity in forced migration contexts?

The literature on social cohesion in forced migration focuses on the concept as a process that promotes participation in host communities and facilitation of generalized trust among local people and the forcibly displaced. The main omission in these studies is that social cohesion as a concept and a process is expected to unfold in a defined geography: the receiving state. By studying the model of social cohesion that has emerged in Turkey, this research discusses how social cohesion as concept, practice and process may be refined to overcome the challenges imposed by uncertainty and precarity of forcibly displaced populations around the world. The study proposes to think through social cohesion by creating synergies among “durable solutions” and “context sensitive solutions”.

2. Inclusive Pathways? Applying an Intersectional Lens on the Integration of Diverse Newcomers in Germany

A perspective, that takes into account the intersections of different dimensions of diversity such as experiences of forced migration, disability and gender has so far received little attention in the municipal management and implementation of social work with newcomers. Intersectionality analyzes the interweavings of different social categories and power relations such as heterosexism, racism, classism and ableism (Winker and Degele 2009). An intersectional perspective argues that categories of social inequality cannot be considered separately from one another, since they determine the experiences of individuals in their interrelationships.

Based on the results of two empirical studies on the experiences of refugee mothers in family education programs in Germany and the situation of refugees with disabilities in the City of Munich, the paper shows to what extent a stronger orientation towards inclusion can provide important impulses for practice. In both studies institutional and structural barriers to accessing settlement services, ECEC, language instruction and the rehabilitation sector can be reconstructed. Lack of institutional adaption is shown as an important barrier for the inclusion of refugee newcomers in Germany. Looking at concrete family cases and the situation of refugee newcomers living with disabilities, we see how intersectional processes of inclusion and exclusion are structured along differences in gender, family setting, disability, educational status and literacy, rural and urban environments, and legal status.

In Europe, only with the ratification of the UN- Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) in the year 2009 has an understanding of inclusion and diversity prevailed that establishes the equal participation of all regardless of disability, gender, migration, age and others in all aspects of social life as a human right. Inclusion as demanded in the CRPD means that society and its institutions need to adapt their structures to be accessible for all humans and provide possibilities to fully participate in societies. Drawing from the theoretical stance of Disability Studies, and holistic integration theories the paper discusses how an intersectional analysis highlights the importance of reshaping the policies, discourse and definition of integration, and the consequences this can have on service delivery, and evaluation of integration and settlement. Theories of refugee integration can benefit from the framing of inclusion in Disability studies and how it has evolved. Critical Disability studies draw attention to the disabling conditions in society, social structures, attitudes, discrimination, and multiple barriers that restrict people's participation in society (Hirschberg and Köbsell 2016). The paper proposes re-examining common concepts of integration as it is applied in migration research (Esser 2004) in light of these intersecting challenges, and ensuring that models of refugee integration are linked to broader discourses on inclusion and participation.

Panel 5

Alternative Approaches and Concepts

HAKKI ONUR ARINER

Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ), Ankara

3. Social Cohesion "on the Sly": The Consequences of Turkey's Covert Harmonization Policy and Options for Pragmatic Durable Solutions

Drafted in 2018 following an inclusive process with the participation of the relevant state and non-state stakeholders, and covering the years 2018-2023, the Harmonization Strategy and National Action Plan of the Ministry of Interior of Turkey Directorate General for Migration Management (DGMM) was only made public in 2020. The late publication of what is essentially the policy document detailing the integration (or "harmonization" as the preferred concept in the Law on Foreigners and International Protection) of migrants and refugees is emblematic of Turkey's ill-fated attempt to promote social cohesion covertly. This approach has led to a lack of public debate on the shape and scope of Turkey's efforts to integrate the large numbers of migrants and refugees within its borders, resulting in a lack of knowledge about and ownership of the process as a whole. In a context marked by the Government's reluctance to engage with the issue of social cohesion publicly, municipalities, chambers of industry and commerce as well as NGOs operating in various sectors of the refugee response in Turkey have found creative workarounds to structural obstacles such as the large informal market as well as ambiguity in relevant legislation. While multistakeholder coordination processes such as the 3RP and the GIZ initiated social cohesion roundtables have sought to support the formation of a consensus on how to promote social cohesion in line with the HSNAP, a sharp rise in anti-migrant/anti-refugee sentiment has emerged following an economic downturn in Turkey exacerbated by the Covid-19 pandemic, leading to an unprecedented level of politicization of the issue of the future of refugees in Turkey. The scapegoating of refugees and migrants for economic troubles seems to be on the rise as national surveys show strong support for the return of refugees to their countries of origin, a sentiment echoed with the increasingly anti-refugee/anti-migrant rhetoric of both government and opposition parties. A pragmatic approach to the promotion of social cohesion is therefore called for that simplifies the confusing terminology around social cohesion by presenting the options in the form of the three durable solutions championed by the UNHCR, namely local integration, resettlement and repatriation, as well as the more recently formulated "other local solutions" in the Global Compact on Refugees. Any repatriation process that is envisaged for SuTPs in the near future, apart from the obvious necessity to conform to international refugee and human rights law, needs to be coupled with a clearly defined local integration and/or other local solution policy, according to which integration efforts are directed to those who cannot be repatriated (in line with the principles of non-refoulement and the best interests of the child) or those who fulfill certain predetermined conditions, such as working formally in Turkey. Such a policy can be expected to incentivize local integration and thus communicated as a palatable solution to the host community.

4. Concepts of Refugee Protection in Islamic Tradition

By any measure, the issue of refugees occupies an important place in the contemporary international agenda. Millions of people around the world are becoming refugees and internally displaced because of wars and conflicts, natural disasters, climate change and other reasons.

Unfortunately, a considerable number of developed societies are witnessing “the re-emergence of racism, xenophobia and that brand of populism which always tries to generate confusion in the public opinion between refugees, migrants and even terrorists.” Moreover, the governments of many developed countries are seeking to reinterpret articles of international law relating to refugees in an attempt to circumvent their duties and free themselves of the refugee burden.

Arab and Muslim states are not exempt from this problem. On the contrary, millions of refugees worldwide are Muslim or hosted in Muslim countries.

Although, many Muslim countries suffer from the burden of refugees, few of them possess domestic legislation which deals with refugees or migrants. In fact, less than two-thirds of OIC Member States (35 of 57) have ratified the 1951 Refugee Convention. Why is that? Is that due to contradiction between Islamic tradition and the 1951 Refugee Convention? Also, does Islamic tradition have any views, regulations, guidelines or principles concerning refugee status? If so, are there any similarities between the Islamic tradition relating to the laws of aman (safe conduct) and the 1951 Geneva Convention relating to the status of refugees?

This paper attempts to clarify the position of Islamic tradition towards refugees based on the main Islamic Sunnī sources and examine the interface between this tradition and the 1951 Refugee Convention. In addition, it will introduce the main concepts of refuge which the Islamic tradition has used and identified, like the concept of *jiwar* (protection), *hijra* (migration) and *aman* (safe conduct). Also, the paper will do brief comparison between the Islamic tradition relating to the laws of *aman* and the 1951 Refugee Convention.

Panel 6

Issues of Access: Statuses and Public Services

Arda AKCICEK *Medipol University, Istanbul* _____

1. Projecting Post-Pandemic Refugee Context in Turkey and Revisiting the NGO and Public Humanitarian Response

This study intends to identify post-pandemic refugee context in terms of refugees' access to labour market, education, healthcare, protection services, and pandemic's potential impact on their social integration and future of humanitarian response of public and NGO sectors in Turkey. Findings of the study are concluded based on a field research conducted in Turkey's 13 provinces through virtual in-depth interviews with 64 participants and analysed in four categories, as of refugees' access to labour market and to healthcare, education and protection services. In the post-pandemic context, refugees in Turkey are going to deal with pandemic's negative effects on economy that has caused loss of jobs and income, which resulted in increasing poverty for refugees. Their lack of access to labour market will not only result in a poorer and more distressed group, but also an isolated community that is closed to social integration in the post-pandemic era.

Key words: COVID-19, refugees, post-pandemic era, humanitarian response, Turkey

2. Panoramic Evaluation on Syrians' Access to Healthcare Services: The Barrier Faced at Field Level and the Opportunities Projected at Central Level

The civilian popular uprising in Syria that started in the context of the Arab Spring in the beginning of 2011 has turned into a civil war in a short time. Since inception in 2011, the civil war in Syria has caused in one of the most notable and protracted refugee crises of the modern times. Turkey was unprecedentedly affected from this civil war taking place just across the border in the world's most unfortunate region. Although many different disciplines have carried out researches on Syrians under temporary protection in Turkey, it is identified that the majority of these researches are directed towards social cohesion issues of such population. In this sense, there is a significant deficiency for researches on access to quality and equitable health care for refugees from the point of view of urban refugee concept. Indeed, health-related indicators are carrying out a vital role in terms of social inclusion, since it is one of the constructive layer and/or a sub-field for any type of inclusion matter. In this framework, the objective of this study is to present the existing legislative framework for Syrians in Turkey, and barriers on transferring acquired rights and services into practice especially in the field of health. The study aims to explore the needs for specialized healthcare services among refugees and sub-categories inside the community residing in Turkey, compared to the availability of services and to compile a set of recommendations for policy makers' possible prospective action. The one of the most prominent contribution to the literature of this study lied behind providing findings in a structured manner regarding the access level to health services of sub-groups (specifically persons with disabilities and the ones have war-related injuries) in Syrian refugees in Turkey. In this sense, the need for healthcare services among war-injured people and complicated cases was researched in a cross-sectional study following a deductive approach, using triangulation to validate the discourses of governmental and non-governmental service providers.

Panel 6

Issues of Access: Statuses and Public Services

Zeynep YANASMAYAN *DeZIM, Berlin* _____

3. Access to Citizenship in Turkey and Germany

Citizenship is traditionally understood in three dimensions, as a set of rights, as a legal status and as a marker of identity. While globalization and international labour division destabilized all three aspects of citizenship, recent theorizations detect an "instrumental", "strategic" turn in citizenship acquisitions, closely connected with mobility rights. Yet our knowledge about to what extent this holds true for refugees, particularly in the cases under scrutiny here is very limited. Therefore, this contribution aims to kick this debate off for Syrian refugees in Germany and Turkey, countries that have received a considerable number of Syrian refugees following the civil war. Moreover, Germany and Turkey have similar citizenship regimes, departing from an ethno-national understanding yet they currently offer very divergent pathways to citizenship for Syrians -Germany a regularized procedure and Turkey an exceptional procedure-. The contribution discusses the implications of these procedural differences for Syrian refugees and seeks to point out the main challenges, particularly in relation to lack of data.

Fatih AYNA *Gaziantep Provincial Directorate of Migration Management, Gaziantep*

Elif Yagmur SAHBUDAK *Gaziantep University, Gaziantep*

4. Thinking of Gaziantep Provincial Migration Management Directorate Request, Complaint and Suggestion Form as an Example of Good Practice

After the migration of Syrians to our country due to the conflicts in Syria in 2011, Gaziantep has become the second city hosting the most significant number of asylum seekers in Turkey. According to Gaziantep Provincial Migration Management Directorate's data, 457,533 foreigners with Temporary Protection Status live in the province. Local governments, public institutions, and Non-Governmental organizations cooperate to solve the problems experienced by Syrians in the city. New issues in migration management have begun to be shared with the Covid-19 pandemic that took place in March 2020. During this epidemic period, when people were quarantined for a long time, Syrians were deeply affected like everyone else in our country. Between May 11-18 2020, the Gaziantep Provincial Migration Management Directorate conducted an online survey to on the level of exposure in the Covid-19 epidemic on the Syrians living in Gaziantep. As a result of the research, it was determined that there is a need for local governments to produce solution-oriented policies in cooperation with non-governmental organizations in solving the problems faced by Syrians during the epidemic. The Request, Complaint, and Suggestion Form created by Gaziantep Provincial Migration Management Directorate have established a request mechanism that Syrians can access primarily during the pandemic process. In the resolution of incoming applications, public institutions, NGOs, and local governments cooperate, contributing to the solution of the problems. A total of 34.701 applications were received in 13 months through the mentioned platform. The majority of incoming applications were at the request of a Temporary Protection procedures. 894 Syrians applied for social assistance. Social assistance requests were conveyed to relevant local and international non-governmental organizations. Gaziantep Provincial Migration Management Directorate Request, Complaint and Suggestion form, designed as a platform where foreigners can submit their requests, complaints, and suggestions without risking their health and without the need of any mediator, provides easier access to public services. The platform is also evaluated as an example of good practice by strengthening the cooperation between non-governmental organizations and public institutions, included Syrians in decision-making process and empowerment of Syrians.

Panel 7

Economics, Labour Market

Christian HUNKLER Zerrin SALIKUTLUK

Berlin Institute for Integration and Migration Research (BIM), Berlin _____

1. Optimistic Immigrants, Disenchanted Refugees? Educational Plans Among Young Adult Refugees and Other Immigrant Groups in Germany

Over the previous decades, international migration has become an increasingly diverse phenomenon. Push factors, e.g., wars or conflicts, grew in importance compared to pull factors, e.g., labor shortages in receiving countries, which prompted an increase in the movement of refugees. Previous research indicates that compared to other immigrant groups, refugees experience more struggles in accessing the labor market. Using data from the IAB-SOEP Study of Migrants and the IAB-BAMF-SOEP Study on Refugees, we investigate whether investments in host country-specific human capital are the reason. Specifically, we compare the educational plans of refugees with certain residence prospects, refugees with uncertain residence prospects, labor migrants, and family migrants in Germany. Our results reveal that refugees are more likely to plan to invest in host country-specific education and training than labor and family immigrants, even after taking compositional differences into account. However, their plans might not be solely based on economic reasons but be a strategy to extend their residence permit in Germany. Therefore, we compare refugees' investment plans collected in interviews before and after the introduction of a new integration law granting a five-year toleration status to refugees who have taken up dual vocational education. We show that the new law increased vocational aspirations for refugees from countries with lower protection rates to just slightly above the levels of those who can expect a certain residence status. Hence, the incentives created by the new law, cannot explain refugees' higher motivation to invest in receiving country-specific qualifications in general.

2. Labour Market Integration of Forced Migrants in Turkey: Overview and Outlook

Massive inflows of forced migrants can significantly alter labor market conditions in host countries. As a separate but related issue, integration of forced migrants into host country labor markets is a challenging process and there is an ongoing policy debate aiming to facilitate integration. A rapidly expanding literature uses unexpected movement of large crowds across boundaries to formulate quasi-experimental designs for the purpose of identifying causal effects of forcibly displaced individuals on labor market outcomes in host countries. This paper provides a detailed overview of the existing evidence about the labor market integration of refugees. Although the main focus is on the Turkish case, the topic of labor market integration is more broadly discussed to cover a wide range of countries and time periods.

Panel 7

Economics, Labour Market

Ulrike SCHULZ

City of Munich Department of Labor & Economic Development, Munich

3. Study on Labor Market Prospects of Women with a Refugee Background

Women with a refugee background are significantly less likely to be represented in employment support measures and so far have been less likely to enter the labor market than refugee men. In order to improve the labor market integration of female refugee through targeted support measures, stakeholders need in-depth knowledge not only about the various challenges women face, but also about the potential that can be tapped. Until recently little had been known about this topic for the Munich area from the perspective of the target group. In order to learn more we conducted a qualitative a study (2019-2020) to investigate whether and under what conditions women with a refugee background want to or are able to be gainfully employed. The study is a measure of the European Charter Action Plan for Gender Equality and was carried out by our Department of Labor and Economic Development (RAW) of the City of Munich as part of the Munich Employment and Qualification Program (MBQ). One of the aims of Munich's employment policy is to promote women with a refugee background and support their labor market integration so that interested potential female employees and companies "come together". The study design is oriented towards multi-perspective and participatory research approaches. The qualitative research design of data collection includes guided interviews. Interviews were conducted with the target group of women with a refugee background as well as with selected experts from various facilities and institutions in Munich. The study focuses on the following questions:

- What are the life plans of the women interviewed, what expectations do they have and what experiences they have already gathered?
- What plans are the women pursuing with regard to gainful employment?
- Which aspects are important for their work orientation?
- What are important framework conditions, what challenges and contradictions do the women experience?
- What approaches to solutions do the interviewees see?

We would be happy to present the design and results of the study at the refugee integration conference in Istanbul. In addition, we would like to present one practical example from the project funding of our municipal employment and qualification program MBQ: Digital Woman Program from ReDI School of Digital Integration; a project that especially addresses woman with refugee background. We would be eager to exchange experiences with municipal representative and the participants of the conference on the opportunities and challenges of the labor market integration of women with a refugee background from the perspectives of Istanbul and other host cities.

4. Ethnic Enclaves and Economic Integration of Syrian Refugees in Turkey

Drawing on data from a survey of over 6,000 Syrian refugees, this article first examines individual, cohort and province-level factors associated with both their labour market activities and occupation statuses of refugees in the Turkey. We find that those who are younger, men, having a diploma higher than secondary school, having better Turkish language proficiency and those who had higher income levels before migration, on average, have higher likelihood of being employed. We later benefited from the heterogenous population distribution of Syrian refugees both across and within provinces to find the causal impact of living in ethnic enclaves on the economic integration of refugees.

Key words: refugee, ethnic enclaves, economic integration, employment

Panel 8

How to Talk About Controversies?

Ahmet ICDUYGU Birce DEMIRYONTAR

MireKoç / Koc University, Istanbul

1. Safe Zones and Return of Refugees: A Debate on Syrians in Turkey

The international refugee regime responds to refugee mobility with three options: first, local integration and settlement in the country of first asylum; second, resettlement in a third country; and third, repatriation to the country of origin. Starting with the 1990s, the international refugee regime began to transform from a model of offering more permanent asylum outside the country of origin; to an arrangement of temporary protection close to the borderland, or a "safe zone", designated inside the country of origin, often along its border with the first countries of asylum. Against backdrop of increasing securitization and politicization of refugee flows, contemporary safe zones are envisaged with two functions: first, to prevent the refugees from crossing the border, by providing a safe space within their countries of origin; and second, to facilitate the return of the refugees who have already crossed the border. In the early years of Syrian refugee mobility, beginning in 2011, the safe zone debate was featured in relation to prevent the refugees from crossing the border in the first place. However, due to the rapid escalation of violence and the volatility of the environment in Syria, such preventive zones deemed arduous to establish. Thus, an emphasis on return after the area is secured and rebuilt became considerably more prevalent. However, an emphasis on return endangers the right to seek asylum and the principle of non-refoulement. To overcome these, returns are expected to be voluntary, safe and sustainable. Returns to the safe zones driven by the political, economic military and strategic interests of the refugee-receiving countries rarely fulfil these three qualities, and often fail to provide sustainable solutions to refugee displacement.

This paper explicates the controversy over the establishment of a safe zone in Syrian-Turkish border with respect to the expected likelihood of refugee returns. The initial analysis is conducted by drawing lessons from the earlier examples of safe zones in Sri Lanka; Northern Iraq; Bosnia; Rwanda and Somalia to identify the ways in which these safe areas have been established, ascertain their actual safety, elaborate on the sustainability of return and attempt to determine why some are more effective than others. The implications of these cases are significant not only for making judgements on the roles and functions of safe zones, but for elaborating their successes and failures concerning the return question of refugees. This analysis is connected to the case of Syrians in Turkey through an investigation of both international and local debates emerging in scholarly research, policy documents, and media coverages. It is also supported by interview and unofficial exchange of data, conducted with high rank officials, including ten ambassadors to Turkey of the EU member states, the ambassador of the EU to Turkey, and high-rank key government officials from Turkey. The analysis on Syrian return, specifically focuses on the long-term efficiency and sustainability, also with reference to concerns over safe zones creating internally displaced populations. This article is concluded with a debate on the form, roles and functions a possible safe zone in the Turkish-Syrian border should pertain, for a durable and sustainable return policy.

Hidayet SİDDİKOĞLU

Bilim Organization for Research & Social Studies, Ankara

2. Migrations from Afghanistan and Securitization of Afghan Refugees in Turkey: Issues of Integration and Social Cohesion

What dominated world politics, academia, and mass media in August 2021 were discussions and quests to answer how the United States (US) and coalition forces ended up in a fiasco in Afghanistan. While many in the West called it hasty and imprudent withdrawal, others, particularly in Europe and Turkey, were highly concerned about potential out-migration from Afghanistan towards the West. In response to looming security threats, the US and coalition forces raced against time to evacuate their citizens. But, on the other hand, Afghans feared the Taliban that they would roll back two decades of hard-won gains in education, political rights, and women empowerment in the country. For those who fear the Taliban, the Western pledges (though not explicitly pronounced) to airlift and provide Afghan partners (those who worked for the US and coalition forces' military and non-military institutions, including women rights activities) safe haven in the West has become a panacea to escape the Taliban rule. As a result, with a hope to flee the country, millions of Afghans from across the country flocked to the Kabul International Airport.

Criticality of the security situations and record increase in the number of displaced populations, 5.5 million², has sent shocking waves to countries already home to a large number of Afghan refugees such as Iran (3.5 million), Pakistan (1.4 million), Turkey (over 300,000) and Germany (147,994).³ While securitization theories of refugees such as building walls, containing outmigration from Afghanistan, and establishment of "deportation centers" in Afghanistan's neighboring countries to receive Afghan deportees from Europe is rife and dominate the contemporary Western discussion on Afghanistan,⁴ countries like Turkey and Pakistan have explicitly stated that they cannot handle any additional refugee burden.⁵

However, there is a mixed perception of migration that it brings both challenges and opportunities.⁶ The opportunities migration offers to host communities are economic growth, multiculturalism, expansion in infrastructure, services, and skills, while challenges have been exclusion, discrimination, and resource sharing (Ibid). Whatever one wants a refugee to be, refugees' challenges and opportunities cannot be underestimated. Moreover, today it is becoming increasingly apparent that whether protracted refugee situations in Iran or Pakistan or new refugee influx to the West, securitization of refugees as an existential threat to socioeconomic, cultural, and political values of society has been one of the key impediments in cohesion, integration processes in host communities. Further, the institutionalization of refugees as a security threat or threatening others, in host societies (by a wide array of orators including state, non-state organizations, scholarship, and media) has in itself created a security concern raising xenophobic sentiments among the public, further deepening polarization in societies.

This study explores issues surrounding the growing negative perception of refugees whether or not the institutionalization of refugees as a security threat impacts the process of social cohesion and integration in host societies. To grasp the theoretical perspective of the issue, this study employs securitisation theory as a method to demonstrate whether the changing perception of Afghan refugees as a matter of security threat to Turkish societies developed pertinent to popular anti-refugee discourses or it evolved due to the socioeconomic burden of Afghan refugees in host communities. To probe this further, this study will examine contemporary accounts on Afghan refugees as a threat to Turkish society from a theoretical perspective in which it will assess how securitising actors depict the process of institutionalisation of Afghan refugees and what are the social and political implications of securitization of Afghan refugees in Turkish societies.

Panel 8

How to Talk About Controversies?

Murat ERDOGAN *Turkish German University, Istanbul*

3. Syrians Barometer: "Social Acceptance" and "Securitization from Society"

"The number of refugees in Turkey exceeded 4 million in a short period of time due to the civil war in Syria, and Turkey has become the country hosting the largest number of refugees from 2014 onwards. The concerns of Turkish society, which portrayed an extraordinary solidarity initially, have become apparent in terms of refugees, almost all of whom live side-by-side with Turkish society in urban areas. This paper is based on a comprehensive and representative "Syrians Barometer" research data about Turkish citizens' attitudes towards Syrian refugees. This study critically analyses traditional securitisation studies and instead puts forward the concepts of the "securitization from society" and "social acceptance" to be able to analyse the views of Turkish public towards Syrian refugees."

4. Immigrant Policies in Germany and Turkey: Welfare State's "Integration" versus Neoliberal "Precarious Inclusion"

Migration is not a new phenomenon for Turkey. Nevertheless since 2014 with the Syrian migration Turkey has started to be considered as the country of immigration rather than an emigration. In order to overcome the conceptual quagmire of "immigrant integration", Turkey opt for the concept of "social harmony" as the policy goal. This conceptual preference also reflects the "methodological nationalism" (Wimmer and Glick-Schiller 2003) and governmental perspective over the refugee flow. Nevertheless, similar to the concept of immigrant integration, social harmony addresses the aim of the government for the whole society and ignore the vulnerability the migrants and refugees in practice.

Although the discussion on the pitfalls of integration has been on the agenda of research and policy for a long time, recent research has urged to abandon it since immigrant integration actually contribute to the problem which it actually aimed to address (Schinkel 2018; Rytter 2019). The concept of "precarious inclusion" addresses many concerns in the relationship between refugees and migrants and states (Rytter and Ghandchi 2019). While integration and social harmony reflects the welfare perspective on immigrant policies, precarious inclusion respond to the neoliberal concerns for immigrant inclusion. Although the concept of precarious inclusion came to the agenda of research recently, it addresses not only the vulnerability and concerns of refugees and recent migrants but the guest labour migration experience of Germany. This paper aims to discuss the concepts of immigrant integration, social harmony and precarious inclusion in the context of Germany and Turkey. It elaborates the inclusion of immigrants under three dimensions: structural, socio-economic and socio-cultural. Considering the vulnerable position of refugees and migrants in the context of legal status, labour market participation and access to state services and facilities (health, education, accommodation, racism), it has been concluded that both in Germany and Turkey, migrants and refugees experience precarious inclusion at various degrees. The diffusion of neoliberal policies between countries contribute to the problem thus precarity of immigrant inclusion.



